Chanukah Lighting in Public Places
Halachically Speaking is a monthly publication compiled by Rabbi Moishe Dovid Lebovits, a former chaver kollel of Yeshiva Torah Vodaath and a musmach of Harav Yisroel Belsky zt”l. Rabbi Lebovits currently works as the Rabbinical Administrator for the KOF-K Kosher Supervision.

Each issue reviews a different area of contemporary halacha with an emphasis on practical applications of the principles discussed. Significant time is spent ensuring the inclusion of all relevant shittos on each topic, as well as the psak of Harav Yisroel Belsky, zt”l on current issues.

WHERE TO SEE HALACHICALLY SPEAKING

Halachically Speaking is distributed to many shuls. It can be seen in Flatbush, Lakewood, Five Towns, Far Rockaway, and Queens, The Flatbush Jewish Journal, baltimorejewishlife.com, The Jewish Home, chazaq.org, and frumtoronto.com. It is sent via email to subscribers across the world.

To sponsor an issue please call 718-744-4360

© Copyright 2017 by Halachically Speaking
Chanukah lights are kindled in most shuls. This has also expanded to public Chanukah lightings in many cities throughout the world. There is also a large Chanukah lighting in the White House, attended by many officials.

In addition, people light candles at Chanukah parties in halls and at weddings. In this issue we will discuss why there is a custom to light in shul and the halachos related to that practice, and then discuss public lightings. Is there a source for it, and should a brachah be recited?

The Origin

At the time of the miracle of Chanukah, there was no widespread custom to light the menorah, even in the home. Chanukah was established as days of joy and happiness, and candles were only lit in the Beis Hamikdash in front of the public. When the Jews were exiled they enacted to light candles outside. Eventually, people lit inside because of danger. It was instituted to light in shul, which is comparable to the lighting in the Beis Hamikdash.

Source – Chanukah Lighting in Shul

The requirement to light Chanukah candles is limited to

---

1 Refer to www.menorah.net.
3 For more on this see Headlines (Lichtenstein) pages 367-372.
4 Rambam, Hilchos Chanukah 3:3.
5 Moadim U’zmanim 6:89. Also see Ohr Yitzchak 1:226. Based on this, since it was an old custom done in the Beis Hamikdash we can say a brachah on the lighting in shul (see below) (Moadim U’zmanim 6:89).
the home. If one does not have a home there is no obligation to light. However, there is still a custom to light in shul, which is no one's home.

The custom to light Chanukah lights in shul is not mentioned in the Gemara, although it is mentioned by Rishonim, and many follow this custom. This also applies to a beis midrash designated for learning.

**Reasons**

There are a number of reasons given as to why we light Chanukah lights in shul.

1. It is for guests who do not have a home, just as Kiddush in shul on Friday night was enacted for guests.

2. It is in order to publicize the miracle of Chanukah.

---

6 Rambam, Hilchos Chanukah 4:1. See Tosafos, Maseches Sukkah 46a "ha'roeh"; Rashi, Maseches Shabbos 23a "ha'roeh." Also refer to Igros Moshe, Y.D. 3:14, and Pnei Yehoshua, Maseches Shabbos 21b "b'Gemara."

7 Shibolei Haleket 185; Kol Bo 44; Hamanlig 2, page 531; Meiri, Maseches Shabbos 23b; Ritva, Maseches Shabbos 23a; Orchos Chaim, Chanukah 17; Tur, Shulchan Aruch 671:7; Chayei Adam 154:17; Piskei Moshe 12:1; M’Beis Levi, page 17:1. Maoz Tzur is also recited at a shul lighting (Siach Yitzchak 337), as well as Haneiros Halalu (Mekor Chaim 671:7; Natei Gavriel, Chanukah 40:1, old).

8 Mishnah Berurah 671:39; Kaf Hachaim 65.

9 For a nice review of the reasons see Piskei Moshe 12:1.

10 Beis Yosef 671; Kol Bo 44. Refer to Minchas Yitzchak 6:65:1 which says based on this perhaps a child under thirteen can’t light the menorah in shul.

11 One recites a brachah on Chanukah lighting in shul even if one does not have the practice of making Kiddush in shul (Pri Chadash 671:4).

12 Shuchan Aruch, O.C. 269.

13 For more on this see Moadim U’zmanim 2:141 in depth if publicizing the miracle applies to non-Jews. Also see Hisorerus Teshuva 3:457:1; Kinyan Torah 8:34; B’mehitzas Rabbeinu page 139; Shevus Yitzchak, Chanukah 46; Igros Moshe, O.C. 4:105:7; Lehoros Nissau 4:63, 12:51; Chashukei Chemed, Maseches Shabbos 21b; Ohr Yisrael footnotes 289-290; Mishnas Yaakov, Hilchos Chanukah page 289.

4 | HALACHICALLY SPEAKING
known as *pirsumei nisa*. The Gra compares it to the recital of Hallel at the Pesach Seder, which serves to publicize the miracle.

3. The candles are lit in shul in order to exempt those who lack the knowledge or motivation to light candles on their own. Some question this reasoning: why should we light for those not motivated? Guests can contribute to the lighting of the homeowner, and those who do not have a place to stay are exempt. In addition, perhaps that is what Chanukah is all about, to bring people closer to Judaism with the lighting.

4. Another reason given is a remembrance for the Beis Hamikdash. A shul is like a small Beis Hamikdash, so we light Chanukah candles there as a remembrance of the lighting in the Beis Hamikdash.

5. The Rivash maintains that we light in shul because in our homes we light indoors (outside of Eretz Yisrael), which limits the extent of publicizing the miracle. Therefore, we light in shul to make up for this lack.

---

14 *Beis Yosef* 671; *Kol Bo* 44; *Ritva* ibid.; *Meiri* ibid.; *Shulchan Aruch* 671:7. Refer to *Minchas Yitzchak* 6:65:1 which says based on this reason a child under thirteen can perhaps light the menorah in shul. This is also the opinion of the *Yalkut Yosef, Chanukah* page 203:16. Refer to *Miyum Hahalachah* 3:82. See *Teshuvos V’hanhagos* 2:335 which says a child can light in shul if all present are lighting according to the manner described in the Gemara (outside and not high up). See *Teshuvos V’hanhagos* 1:397, 2:342. Some suggest that since one of the reasons to light is because of guests, although not common, we still need to have the lighting done by someone who is an adult (*M’Beis Levi* 10, page 17:3). See *Piskei Shmuos* (Chanukah) pages 67-68; *Shraga Hameir* 2:16; *Kinyan Torah* 1:131:1, 6:49; *Ashrei Ha’ish* 3, page 250; *Yeishiv Moshe* page 86; *Piskei Moshe* 12, pages 419-420.

15 671.

16 *Kol Bo, Hilchos Pesach* 50. For more on this see *Ohr Yitzchak* 1:226.

17 *Binyan Shlomo, Chanukah* 53. However, see *Sdei Chemed, Mareches Chanukah* 24, page 112; *Minchas Elazar* 2:68.

18 Kol Bo 44.


20 See *Ohr Yitzchak* 1:226.
It seems that most poskim assume that the reason for the custom is to publicize the miracle.\(^{21}\)

**Refrain**

Others say since we light in our homes there is no need to have lights in shul.\(^{22}\) However, this is not the overwhelming custom.\(^{23}\)

Some have the custom not to recite a brachah on the lighting in shul in Eretz Yisrael. Since the custom there is to place the Chanukah menorah outside, this obviates one of the main reasons for lighting in shul.\(^{24}\)

It is questionable if one should light in a hotel that is rented out for Chanukah and has a room reserved for davening.\(^{25}\)

**Brachah and Questions**

Many poskim debate whether or not to recite a brachah on lighting in shul.\(^{26}\) Some question how we can make a brachah if it is not mentioned in the Gemara (see above).\(^{27}\)

Some argue that no brachah is recited on a custom,\(^{28}\) such as the custom of aravos on Hoshana Rabbah.\(^{29}\)

One response is that candle lighting in shul is like Hallel on Rosh Chodesh which is a custom, and the Ashkenazim

---

\(^{21}\) *Shulchan Aruch* 671:7; *Chayei Adam* 154:17; *Yabia Omer*, O.C. 7:57.

\(^{22}\) See *Shibolei Haleket* 185; *Birchei Yosef* 671:6; *Moadim U’zmanim* 6:89; *Darchei Chaim V’shalom* 819.

\(^{23}\) *Kaf Hachaim* 71.

\(^{24}\) *Moadim U’zmanim* 6:89; *Teshuvos V’hanhagos* 1:397, 2:335. Refer to *Mekadesh Yisrael* (Chanukah) 115 which says a shul should still light even if one lights his regular menorah inside.

\(^{25}\) *Mekadesh Yisrael* (Chanukah) 102. The same would apply to a bais avel (ibid.).

\(^{26}\) For more on this see *Minhag Avoseinu B'yadeinu* 1, pages 190-196; *Peninei Chanukah* pages 87-88; *Ashrei Ha'ish* 3, page 250.

\(^{27}\) Refer to *Moadim U’zmanim* 6:89; *Teshuvos V’hanhagos* 2:342.

\(^{28}\) *Rambam*, Hilchos Ta'anis 11:16.

\(^{29}\) Refer to *Maseches Sukkah* 44b; *Tosafos*, *Maseches Sukkah* 44b “kan.”
still recite a *brachah* on it.\(^{30}\) However, the Sephardim do not recite a *brachah* on Hallel on Rosh Chodesh but still recite a *brachah* on Chanukah lighting. This is especially odd since the *Shulchan Aruch* himself rules\(^ {31}\) that no *brachah* is recited on Hallel of Rosh Chodesh and a *brachah* is recited in shul on Chanukah.\(^ {32}\)

One answer is that lighting in shul is not a separate custom, but rather an extension of the main mitzvah.\(^ {33}\) This logic also applies to the *brachah* on Hallel of Rosh Chodesh, since reciting Hallel is generally done for mitzvah purposes.\(^ {34}\) This also explains how we say “v’tzivanu,” since we were commanded to perform the main mitzvah.\(^ {35}\)

Others argue that the custom of Chanukah lighting in shul is different since it serves to publicize the miracle, as opposed to other customs.\(^ {36}\)

As mentioned above, the Gra\(^ {37}\) compares the *brachah* in shul to the *brachah* recited for Hallel in shul on the first two nights of Pesach.\(^ {38}\) The same answer above regarding Hallel on Rosh Chodesh would apply to Hallel on Pesach night in shul.\(^ {39}\)

---


31  *O.C.* 422:2.

32  *Chacham Tzvi* 88; *Shaarei Teshuvah* 10. Refer to *Yabia Omer*, *O.C.* 7:57.

33  Refer to *Tosfos HaRid*, *Maseches Sukkah* 44b. See *Shevet Halevi* 1:185:2; *V’aleihu Lo Yibol* 1, page 224.

34  *Yabia Omer*, *O.C.* 7:57. See *Nemukei Orach Chaim* 671:3.

35  Ibid. See *Yad Nasso* 2:25.

36  *Pri Hasadeh*, *O.C.* 3:2. Refer to *Yabia Omer* ibid.; *Hisorerus Teshuvah* 1:103.

37  671. Refer to *Minhag Avoseinu Byadeinu* 1, pages 194-195.

38  *Shulchan Aruch* 487:4.

39  Refer to *Chasan Sofer* 2, page 173b.
The consensus is to recite a brachah.40

When to Light

The custom is to light the Chanukah menorah in shul between Minchah41 and Ma’ariv.42 This is when everyone is present, and if we would wait until after Ma’ariv people would be delayed in getting home to light.43 Another reason is that since the Menorah in the Beis Hamikdash was lit before sunset, we light then as well.44 The Menorah was lit in the Beis Hamikdash after the korban shel bein ha’arbayim which corresponds to Minchah. Therefore, we light after Minchah.45

This applies even if one’s custom is to light at home after dark.46

Another reason47 is that the crowd is considered a tzibbur when they gather to daven in shul. However, after Ma’ariv when they are leaving they do not have a status of a tzibbur.48 Based on this, if people stay between Minchah and Ma’ariv the menorah should be lit then. However, if people leave after and then return later for Ma’ariv, the Chanukah menorah should be lit before Ma’ariv.49

40 Shulchan Aruch 671:7; Be’er Hagolah; Levush 7; Chayei Adam 154:17; Mishnah Berurah 44; Teshuvos V’hanhagos 2:235; Yabia Omer, O.C. 7:57; Hilchos Chag B’chag (Chanukah) page 121:1; Ashrei Ha’ish 3, page 250; M’Beis Levi 10, page 17:1; Keser Shem Tov page 519.
41 This should be done after shkiah and not before (Teshuvos V’hanhagos 5:223:9).
42 Darchei Moshe 671; Rema 671:7; Chayei Adam 154:1. See Siach Yitzchak 339.
43 Mishnah Berurah 46; Aruch Hashulchan 26; Teshuvos V’hanhagos 2:235.
44 Teshuvos V’hanhagos 2:236.
45 Birchei Yosef/679:2.
46 Mishnah Berurah 46.
47 For another reason see Levush 8; Kaf Hachaim 77.
48 Harerei Kedem 1, page 285:166.
49 Natei Gavriel, Chanukah 41:5-6; Teshuvos V’hanhagos 2:236; Ashrei Ha’ish 3, page 250. See M’Beis Levi 10, page 199. This is common in yeshivah when people go home after Minchah to their homes (Natei Gavriel, Chanukah 40:8). Refer to Shev Yaakov 1:22.
One only lights at the first minyan and not at subsequent minyanim.50

**By Day**

The practice exists51 to light the Chanukah lights in shul by day as well.52 None of the main sources mention this custom,53 and the reasons offered above only apply to night, not the morning.54 Some suggest that this is in remembrance of the Menorah in the Beis Hamikdash, which was lit by day.55 Others argue that this publicizes the miracle, as the light does not serve any practical purpose other than the mitzvah.56

Another reason offered for lighting by day is that at night one generally does not have the candles lit for more than a half hour (see below). To make up for this, we relight candles in the morning.57

In any case the custom is that no brachah is recited in the morning.58

**Erev Shabbos**

On Erev Shabbos, one should make sure to light the Chanukah menorah in shul after everyone has arrived

---

50 M’Beis Levi 10, page 19:9; Piskei Shmuos page 66. Refer to Shulchan Aruch Hamekutzar 120, footnote 36 which differs.
51 See Shulchan Aruch Hamekutzar 120:18, footnote 42 who does not have this custom.
52 Nahar Mitzrayim, Chanukah 12; Rivevos Ephraim 8:273:3; Natei Gavriel, Chanukah 40:15; Minhag Avoseinu Byadeinu 1, page 200.
53 Tzitz Eliezer 22:37:2. See Mor U’ketziah 675.
54 Sdei Chemed Mareches Chanukah 24, page 112.
55 Sdei Chemed ibid.; Likutei Maharich 3, page 707 (new); Mitzvas Ner Ish U’beiso page 42; Tzitz Eliezer 22:37:2.
56 Minhag Avoseinu Byadeinu 1, page 201.
57 Ohr Yisrael, Chanukah page 211, footnote 921.
58 Likutei Maharich ibid.; Yalkut Yosef, Chanukah page 295:20; Mitzvas Ner Ish U’beiso page 49; M’Beis Levi 10, pages 19-20:11; Keser Shem Tov page 519; Rivevos Ephraim 8:273:3.
and *davened* Minchah. However, the custom is that there is no need to wait for a *minyan* to light, since people will eventually come. Therefore, we light before Minchah, especially if it is late. There is no concern of lighting for Shabbos followed by a weekday *davening*, as the lighting simply serves to publicize the miracle to the masses. Nonetheless, this should be avoided if possible.

The above discussion is based on the opinion that a *minyan* is not required for the lighting. Those who do require a *minyan* would not allow the early lighting if no *minyan* is present.

**Minyan Convenes Only on Shabbos**

Even if a shul is only open for Shabbos *davening* the candles are lit there on Friday.

**Motza’ei Shabbos**

On Motza’ei Shabbos one should make sure to have the Chanukah menorah lit before everyone leaves the shul (before Havdalah, if Havdalah is made in shul). The custom is to light it before reciting *Aleinu*. Some question what benefit it is to light on Motza’ei Shabbos since everyone

---

59 *Darchei Moshe* 671. See *Harerei Kedem* 1, page 286:166. Refer to *Pri Megadim, Eishel Avraham* 671:10; *Mor U’ketziah* 671; *Kaf Hachaim* 78; *Biar Halachah* “v’yeish”; *Rivevos Ephraim* 8:265:6; *Nefesh Harav* pages 222-223.

60 *Magen Avraham* 10; *Chayei Adam* 154:17; *Biar Halachah* "v’yeish"; *Mishnah Berurah* 47; Yalkut Yosef, Chanukah page 204:18, footnote 44; *Aruch Hashulchan* 26. See *Minchas Elazar* 2:68; *Nemukei Orach Chaim* 671:4. How are the congregants fulfilling the mitzvah of lighting in shul if they are not there yet? It is possible since they chip in to pay for the use of the shul etc. it is their lights and the one lighting is their messenger (*Moadim U’zmanim* 6:89, page 146).


62 *Siach Yitzchak* 329.


65 *Natei Gavriel, Chanukah* 41:8.
leaves after Ma'ariv.\textsuperscript{66} However, since people can come back to shul when they want and see the candles, it is publicizing the miracle.\textsuperscript{67}

**Where to Place It**

There are differing opinions as to where to place the menorah in shul.\textsuperscript{68} Some maintain to place it in the south since that is where the Menorah was in the Beis Hamikdash.\textsuperscript{69} It can be placed on a table near the southern wall.\textsuperscript{70} The custom is to place the menorah to the right of the aron kodesh,\textsuperscript{71} and the candles are arranged from east to west.\textsuperscript{72}

The one who is lighting should have his back to the south and face to the north.\textsuperscript{73}

Some question why we don’t light the Chanukah candles either outside or at least inside near the window. The answer is that the custom originated from the fact that we used to light outside but then started to light inside due to some external factors. The lighting is for the people inside, and the same concept applies to the shul.\textsuperscript{74}

**Being Yotzei Your Lighting**

Although the custom is to light Chanukah candles in shul, one may not exempt his obligation to light at home with this

\textsuperscript{66} Ohr Yitzchak 1:226.

\textsuperscript{67} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{68} Beis Yosef 671. See Terumas Hadeshen 104; Kaf Hachaim 66. Refer to Piskei Moshe 12, pages 406-410. For a discussion on where to place the menorah in different parts of the world see B’itzel Hachachmah 2:50. Also see Mishneh Halachos 4:81.

\textsuperscript{69} Beis Yosef 671; Tur 671; Shulchan Aruch 671:7; Taz 7; Mishnah Berurah 40-41; Biur Halachah “ab’beis haknesses.” See Sha’arei Teshuvah 671:9.

\textsuperscript{70} Mishnah Berurah 40; Kaf Hachaim 67.

\textsuperscript{71} Piskei Shmuos, Chanakah page 66.

\textsuperscript{72} Mishnah Berurah 42. See Magen Avraham 9; Pri Megadim Eishel Avraham 9.

\textsuperscript{73} Mishnah Berurah 43. See Sha’ar Hatzion 676:21.

\textsuperscript{74} Refer to Ohr Yitzchak 1:226.
lighting.\(^75\) One reason is that the candles in shul are lit before the correct time.\(^76\) Some suggest that the congregants have in mind not to fulfill the obligation of lighting candles.\(^77\) The one who lights in shul can recite *Shehecheyanu* at home as well if he lights at home to exempt his household.\(^78\)

**Who Lights**

The custom is that the *shliach tzibbur* lights at least one light on the menorah.\(^79\) If an *avel davens* Minchah on Erev Chanukah then someone else should light since a *Shehecheyanu* is recited.\(^80\) However, an *avel* can light on the other nights when there is no *Shehecheyanu* recited.\(^81\)

Some question why a guest does not light since one of the reasons for lighting in shul is for guests.\(^82\) In addition, since one of the reasons for lighting is as a remembrance to the Beis Hamikdash, why doesn’t a *kohen* light?\(^83\)

Regardless, the custom seems that the *shatz* lights the menorah,\(^84\) or in some cases the *rav*. Some maintain that the *shatz* lights, since he serves in place of the *kohen* who offered *korbanos*.\(^85\)

---

\(^{75}\) Rivash 111; Beis Yosef 671; Rema 671:7; Chayei Adam 154:17; Mishnah Berurah 45. Refer to Pnei Meivin, O.C. 226:1.

\(^{76}\) See Piskei Moshe 12, pages 388-389.

\(^{77}\) Piskei Moshe 12 ibid.

\(^{78}\) Zera Emes 1:96; Mishnah Berurah 45; Sha’ar Hatzion 53. See Sha’arei Teshuvah 11. Refer to Moedim U’zmanim 6:89; Shalmei Todah, Chanukah 26.

\(^{79}\) Pri Megadim Eishel Avraham 11.

\(^{80}\) Taz 8; Mishnah Berurah 44.

\(^{81}\) Ibid.

\(^{82}\) Siach Yitzchak 340.

\(^{83}\) Ibid.

\(^{84}\) Taz 671:8; Siach Yitzchak 340; Yalkut Yosef (kitzur) 671:11.

\(^{85}\) Keser Shem Tov page 519, footnote 583.
During the lighting, the congregants should stand next to the menorah.86

**Oil vs. Candles**

The custom in most places is to use candles for lighting the menorah in shul.87

**Minyan**

The poskim mention that a minyan should be present when lighting the Chanukah menorah in shul.88 This is usually not an issue during the week since we light between Minchah and Ma’ariv. Those present do not have to actually be davening to be counted toward the ten people.89

Women and children can count toward the minyan in relation to this.90 The custom seems to be that we are not concerned about lighting only with a minyan.91

**How Long Does It Have to Last**

The reality is that the menorah is lit in shul between Minchah and Ma’ariv and then people leave. The question arises how long the lights should stay lit since it is not safe to leave the menorah unattended.

The candles should last for a half hour,92 and if there is

---

86 Natei Gavriel, Chanukah 40:17.
87 Darchei Chaim V’shalom 819; M’Beis Levi 10, page 18:5. See Mor U’ketziah 675. Refer to Piskei Shmuos, Chanukah page 66.
88 Mor U’ketziah 671; Machzik Brachah 7; Kaf Hachaim 72; Yalkut Yosef, Chanukah page 203:17; Siach Yitzchak 339; V’aleihu Lo Yibol 1, page 222. Refer to Siach Yitzchak 330-331; Minchas Elazar 2:68. The opinion of Harav Chaim Kanievsky shlit’a is even if one person is present in shul you can light (Piskei Shmuos, Chanukah pages 66-67). See Divrei Chachamim page 174:496.
89 Piskei Moshe 12, page 400, footnote 25.
90 Yalkut Yosef, Chanukah page 203:17.
91 Teshuvos V’hanhagos 2:336.
92 Pri Megadim Eishel Avraham 675:2; Mishnah Berurah 673:13; Siach Yitzchak 337; Mekadesh Yisrael, Chanukah 105; Shevet Halevi 8:156:1; Teshuvos V’hanhagos 2:342:9; Rivevos Ephraim 5:432:5; M’Beis Levi 10, pages 17-18:3; V’aleihu Lo Yibol 1, page 223. See Ohr Yitzchak 1:226.
a safety concern then one may extinguish them after a half hour.\textsuperscript{93} Some base this on the reason that the candles are lit for guests who do not light; therefore, they must burn for a half hour.\textsuperscript{94} Some suggest that the lights stay lit until the last \textit{minyan} for Ma’ariv has left,\textsuperscript{95} although this is not practiced.

However, the custom is that the candles can be extinguished after Ma’ariv since the main reason for lighting in shul is to publicize the miracle for those present.\textsuperscript{96} In a \textit{shtiebel} where the \textit{rav} lives upstairs it usually is not extinguished since someone is around to check on the candles.

\textbf{Shtiebel}

It is common for a \textit{shtiebel} to have many different rooms where \textit{minyanim} take place. Some opine that every room which has an \textit{aron kodesh} should have Chanukah lights lit.\textsuperscript{97} However, the custom is that only the main shul has the Chanukah lights lit.\textsuperscript{98}

\textbf{Electric Lights}

One does not fulfill his obligation with electric lights. Therefore, one should use regular lights in shul (oil or wax).

\textsuperscript{93} \textit{Shevet Halevi} 8:156:1; \textit{M’Beis Levi} 10, pages 17-18:3.
\textsuperscript{94} \textit{Rivevos Ephraim} 5:432:5; \textit{Teshuvos V’hanhagos} 2:342; \textit{Shevet Halevi} 8:156:1.
\textsuperscript{95} \textit{Ashrei Ha’ish} 3, page 251.
\textsuperscript{96} \textit{Rivevos Ephraim} 3:453:1, 5:29, page 21, 432:5; \textit{Teshuvos V’hanhagos} 2:342; \textit{Shevet Halevi} 8:156:1. Refer to \textit{Teshuvos V’hanhagos} 4:171 which takes issue with this, since one is lighting the candle with intent to extinguish before a half hour (see \textit{Shulchan Aruch} 671:13). Refer to \textit{Ohr Yisrael}, Chanukah page 210 which says from Harav Chaim Kanievsky \textit{shlit’a} that if it does not last for a half hour one has not fulfilled the mitzvah and the \textit{brachah} is invalid. See \textit{Halichos Shlomo}, \textit{Moadim} 2:16:8.
\textsuperscript{97} \textit{Gam Ani Odeicha} page 2:5 quoting the opinion of Harav Chaim Kanievsky \textit{shlit’a}.
\textsuperscript{98} \textit{Ashrei Ha’ish} 3, page 250. Refer to \textit{Mishnas Yosef} 6:127:1.
Family Parties

Many families attend Chanukah parties in a hall. Although some have the practice to recite a brachah on this lighting, it is frowned upon since the custom to light in shul was because it is a shul.\(^9\) This is particularly true according to the reasons that it is a remembrance of the Beis Hamikdash, and that it is like Kiddush in shul.\(^1^0\)

The same concern is true for weddings.\(^1^1\)

Those who do recite a brachah at these parties follow the minority opinion that this is an act of publicizing the mitzvah as well, since many times people who come to these parties are not familiar with the mitzvah per se and this is a chance to publicize the mitzvah.\(^1^2\) Nonetheless, it is preferable to daven Ma'ariv after the lighting at the party so it has a status of a quasi shul at least.\(^1^3\) Some permit it even if one does not daven there.\(^1^4\) Some maintain that even with davening no brachah should be recited.\(^1^5\)

Public Lightings

It has become popular to stage public menorah lightings during Chanukah. This is mainly practiced by Chabad.\(^1^6\)

---

\(^9\) Yabia Omer, O.C. 7:57; Minchas Yitzchak 6:54:3; Tzitz Eliezer 15:30, 22:37:1; Divrei Yatziv, O.C. 28:63; Piskei Shmuos (Chanukah) page 68; Az Nidberu 6:75 quoting the opinion of Harav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach zt"l; Piskei Moshe 12, page 416; Vayevarech Dovid 2:166; Shulchan Aruch Hamekutzar 120, footnote 36; Kinyan Torah 1:131:3; Mekadesh Yisrael (Chanukah) 102; Yad Nassan 2:25; Mitzvas Ner Ish U'beiso page 50; Nefesh Harav page 223.

\(^1^0\) Minchas Chein 2:37; Emes L’Yaakov 677, footnote 590.

\(^1^1\) Harerei Kedem 1, page 285:166.

\(^1^2\) Az Nidberu 6:75, 11:32, 34:3; Yad Nassan 2:25, page 125. Refer to Mekadesh Yisrael (Chanukah) 102.

\(^1^3\) Yabia Omer, O.C. 7:57.

\(^1^4\) Yalkut Yosef (kitzur) 671:9. The reason is if there are ten people it is publicizing the miracle (ibid.); Mishnasicher 2:201.

\(^1^5\) M’Beis Levi 10, page 19:8.

\(^1^6\) The first such lighting was done in Philadelphia in 1974. The Lubavitcher Rebbe launched the project world over in 1987 (http://www.chabad.org/news/article_cdo/aid/1376175/jewish/
Many question doing this with a *brachah* since a *brachah* was only customarily said in a shul setting for reasons mentioned above. They even according to the Rivash that lighting in shul publicizes the miracle, we would not recite a *brachah*, as the shul lighting is supposed to replace the outside lighting.

Perhaps the reason to motivate people would be a good reason for the public lightings (but this would not suffice for making a *brachah* at parties).

Those poskim who do not allow a *brachah* at a party would not allow it at a public lighting either.

Some explain that one can recite a *brachah* while lighting in a public area where thousands are present.

Chabad shluchim, who light in hundreds of locations, usually light with oil and then exchange it for an electric bulb with a candle to bulb converter.

**Kosel**

Lighting a Chanukah menorah at the Kosel with a *brachah* is legitimate, since it is a place where *davening* is held.

---


107 Vaya'an Yosef 3:401:4; Mekadesh Yisrael (Chanukah) 101, 116; Minchas Chein 2:37.
108 Refer to Minchas Chein 2:37 (thanks to my dear friend Rabbi Aryeh Leibowitz for telling me about this source).
109 Az Nidberu 6:75. This can be explained that publicizing the miracle has no bounds so anytime one is publicizing the miracle it is warranted (Shevet Halevi 1:185:1).
110 Refer to www.menorah.net.
111 Az Nidberu 6:75; Rivevos Ephraim 4:163:63; Pri Chaim 1:57; Natei Gavriel, Chanukah 40:4; Moadim U'zmanim 8:143; Mitzvas Ner Ish U'beiso page 51. Refer to Mekadesh Yisrael (Chanukah) 101 which lists some reasons to refrain from lighting at the Kosel.
Minyan at Work

If one has a daily minyan for Minchah and Ma’ariv at work he can light candles there as well, since it has a status of a set minyan even if it is not a shul.112

112 Ohr Yisrael, Chanukah pages 198-199.
PROTECT YOUR BRAIN
AND PROVE YOU HAVE ONE.

Statistics relating to bicycle safety help riders understand the importance of wearing a helmet.

• Bicycle helmets protect your head and reduce the incidence of traumatic brain injury and death whether riding on the sidewalk, street or while mountain biking.

• The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention reports that less than half of all Americans who ride bicycles wear helmets.

• In a twelve month study 800 bicyclists were killed and 515,000 bicycle-related injuries required emergency-room care. Of those, 26,000 of were some type of traumatic brain injury that might have been prevented by wearing a helmet.

• The Insurance Institute of Highway Safety reports that approximately 650 people die annually from brain injury due to bicycle accidents. Of which on average over 92% were not wearing a helmet.

Regardless of age or level of experience, EVERYONE must wear a helmet whenever they ride.

This public awareness message is brought to you by KOF-K Kosher Supervision and BINA in memory of Dr. Heshy Rosenbaum A”H who was tragically taken from us, before the need for bike helmets was recognized, due to a fatal injury while riding a bicycle. Help spread the word and save lives.
Volume 7 Topics:

Parshas Hamann
Tefillin and Chol Hamoed
Tefillin and Bar Mitzvah
Running to and from Shul
Women and Davening
Reciting One Hundred Brachos Daily
Mashed, Ground and Crushed Fruits and Vegetables
The Brachah on Soups
Brachah on Wise People and Kings (Presidents)
Baruch She’petani
Making Early Shabbos
Noise and Shabbos
Birchos Habanim
Women and Working on Rosh Chodesh
Eating Erev Pesach
Buying Chametz in a Supermarket after Pesach
Hallel on Yom Ha’atzma’ut
Working on Tisha B’av
When to Light the Chanukah Menorah
Al Hanissim on Chanukah
Shalom Zachar
Seudas Bris Milah
Avi Leaving His Home During Shivah
Nichum Aveilim
Select Halachos Relevant to the Workplace
Differing Customs Between Husband and Wife
Opening One’s Mouth to the Satan
Summer Halachos Section

IN PREPARATION

Also by the author:
To submit psakim you obtained from Harav Belsky zt""l please email piskeihilvol1@gmail.com
A large variety of pre-packaged kosher pareve products are available in our bakery.

Kosher pre-packaged Chicken, Meat, Cheese and Appetizers available in Kosher Clubs!!

Look for over 100 Kosher Certified Wellsley Farms items throughout the store.

Any questions please call
Rabbi Moishe Lebovits
Rabbinical Administrator KOF-K Kosher Supersision
at 718-744-4560 • email: ml@bjswc.com

2017 BJ's Wholesale Club, Inc.